ORIGINAL PAPER



Novel bacteria capable of degrading phenanthrene in activated sludge revealed by stable-isotope probing coupled with high-throughput sequencing

Jibing Li · Dayi Zhang · Mengke Song · Longfei Jiang · Yujie Wang · Chunling Luo · Gan Zhang

Received: 15 June 2017/Accepted: 19 September 2017/Published online: 27 September 2017 © Springer Science+Business Media B.V. 2017

Abstract The indigenous microorganisms responsible for degrading phenanthrene (PHE) in activated biosludge were identified using DNA-based stable isotope probing. Besides the well-known PHE degraders *Burkholderia*, *Ralstonia*, *Sinobacteraceae* and *Arthrobacter*, we for the first time linked the taxa *Paraburkholderia* and *Kaistobacter* with in situ PHE biodegradation. Analysis of PAH-RHD_{α} gene detected in the heavy DNA fraction of ¹³C-PHE treatment suggested the mechanisms of horizontal

Electronic supplementary material The online version of this article (doi:10.1007/s10532-017-9806-9) contains supplementary material, which is available to authorized users.

J. Li · L. Jiang · C. Luo (⊠) · G. Zhang Guangzhou Institute of Geochemistry, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Guangzhou 510640, China e-mail: clluo@gig.ac.cn

J. Li University of Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing 100039, China

D. Zhang School of Environment, Tsinghua University, Beijing 100084, China

D. Zhang Lancaster Environment Centre, Lancaster University, Lancaster LA1 4YQ, UK

M. Song · C. Luo College of Natural Resources and Environment, South China Agricultural University, Guangzhou 510642, China gene transfer or inter-species hybridisation in PAH-RHD gene spread within the microbial community. Additionally, three cultivable PHE degraders, *Microbacterium* sp. PHE-1, *Rhodanobacter* sp. PHE-2 and *Rhodococcus* sp. PHE-3, were isolated from the same activated biosludge. Among them, *Rhodanobacter* sp. PHE-2 is the first identified strain in its genus with PHE-degrading ability. However, the involvement of these strains in PHE degradation in situ was questionable, due to their limited enrichment in the heavy DNA fraction of ¹³C-PHE treatment and lack of PAH-RHD_α gene found in these isolates. Collectively, our findings provide a deeper understanding of the

Y. Wang

School of Environmental Science and Engineering, Guangdong University of Technology, Guangzhou 510006, China

diversity and functions of indigenous microbes in PHE degradation.

Keywords Indigenous microorganisms \cdot Phenanthrene (PHE) \cdot PHE degraders \cdot DNA-SIP \cdot PAH-RHD_{α} genes

Introduction

To face the worldwide challenge of increasing contamination of freshwater systems with hundreds of anthropogenic chemicals (Schwarzenbach et al. 2006), a list of the most dangerous compounds has been proposed as target for remediation, based on their toxicological properties and actual occurrence in wastewater (Ledin and Patureau 2010). Among the non-conventional priority pollutants, polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) are an important class of organic chemicals, which have two or more fused aromatic rings and can affect both human health and ecosystem function (Minai-Tehrani et al. 2009). They are recognised as high-priority pollutants of particular concern in the environment due to their possible toxic, carcinogenic, and mutagenic properties (Keith and Telliard 1979). Thus, it is of paramount importance to reduce PAHs and eliminate their environmental impacts.

Biodegradation is a proved viable option for reducing PAHs contamination in water and soil (Bahr et al. 2015). Using established cultivation-dependent approaches, many microorganisms capable of degrading PAHs have been isolated and evaluated (Jones et al. 2011; Gutierrez et al. 2013). These works have helped to characterise the metabolic pathways and functional genes associated with PAHs degradation, such as PAH-ring hydroxylating dioxygenases (PAH-RHD) (Cebron et al. 2008). However, an important limitation of these approaches is that the majority of microbes are uncultivable (Amann et al. 1995); only a small proportion of the indigenous bacteria present in natural habitats can be cultivated and isolated on laboratory media which cannot reproduce in situ conditions. In addition, cultivation-based approaches greatly underestimate prokaryotic diversity and fail to mimic the complex interactions among individuals present in natural microbial communities (Oren 2004).

In the last decade, cultivation-independent techniques have been developed to evaluate the prokaryotic diversity of complex microbiota (Breznak 2002), and to link microbial identities to their metabolic functions (Dumont and Murrell 2005). These techniques lead to greater complexity than traditional approaches (Gutierrez 2011) and remove the bias imposed by the isolation of microorganisms necessary for cultivation-dependent methods (Lebaron et al. 2001). Stable isotope probing (SIP) is one such method, which employs stable isotopes (^{13}C) or ¹⁵N) to identify functionally active members within microbial communities by analysing their isotopeenriched intracellular components (DNA, RNA, or proteins) and is especially useful for organisms that are not amenable to cultivation (Singleton et al. 2005; Jiang et al. 2015). High-throughput sequencing (HTS) can provide higher resolution of the structure of complex microbial communities than conventional cloning techniques (Gutierrez 2011). Combined with HTS, DNA-based stable isotope probing (DNA-SIP) is ideally suited to linking microbes within complex microbial communities to their ecological functions (Jameson et al. 2017). Many recent works have begun coupling SIP with HTS to investigate microbial functions in complex environments (Gutierrez et al. 2013; Li et al. 2017; Zhang et al. 2015).

Previous DNA-SIP studies regarding PAHs biodegradation have been limited to contaminated soils and waters, e.g., polluted soils from a former gas manufacturing plant site (Jones et al. 2011) and oilcontaminated seawater from the Deepwater Horizon site (Gutierrez et al. 2013). However, SIP has not yet been employed to examine the potential PAHsdegrading microbes in the activated biosludge of municipal wastewater treatment plants, which contribute significantly to PAHs elimination in water discharge and prevent their release into the environment. In this study, phenanthrene (PHE) was employed as a model PAHs compound, and we applied DNA-SIP to an activated biosludge with the aim of linking the indigenous bacterial taxa to their roles in PHE degradation. Additionally, both cultivation and high-throughput sequencing were used to achieve a deeper understanding of the bacterial communities contributing to PHE degradation. Furthermore, PAH-RHD genes were investigated by analysing the relevant sequences amplified from the ¹³C-DNA-enriched fraction. We hope to provide novel and useful information regarding the biodegradation of PAHs in municipal wastewater treatment systems.

Materials and methods

Sample collection

Settled activated sludge samples were collected from the activated sludge aeration basin of a municipal wastewater treatment plant (23°11'N, 113°24'E; altitude, 13 m) located in Guangdong Province, China. This plant employs anaerobic/anoxic/oxic (A2/O) activated sludge processes and provides a disposal service for nearby municipal sewage and food industry wastewater. After sampling, the activated sludge was immediately transported to the laboratory at 4 °C. Portions of the activated sludge samples were stored frozen for subsequent DNA extraction, and the remaining samples were immediately utilised in PHE degradation and SIP experiments. PAHs in the activated sludge are listed in Table S1 (Supplementary Material), determined using gas chromatographymass spectrometry (GC-MS) according to a standard method described below.

SIP microcosms

A 15-mL sample of activated sludge was placed into a 50-mL serum bottle. The bottles were sealed with rubber stoppers and aluminium caps. Stock solutions of PHE were prepared in dimethyl formamide (DMF) and stored at - 20 °C until used. Unlabelled PHE (99%) or ¹³C-labelled PHE (¹³C₁₄-PHE, 99%; Cambridge Isotope Laboratories Inc., USA) was added to each bottle to reach a final PHE concentration of 10 mg/L. Microcosms without PHE (blank control), and ones using filter-sterilised samples with unlabelled PHE (sterile negative control), were also assembled. Each treatment was conducted in triplicates. All laboratory microcosms were incubated in the dark with 120-rpm shaking at room temperature (~ 25 °C). To maintain oxic conditions, the serum bottles were opened each day for about 1 h in fume cupboard with sterile condition (Li et al. 2017). On days 3 and 6 after incubation, samples from each treatment were sacrificed for PHE analysis and DNA extraction.

Nucleic acid extraction and ultracentrifugation

Activated sludge samples were collected at the beginning and end of PHE degradation. DNA was

extracted from triplicate microcosms (6 mL) of each treatment at different time points using a PowerSoil DNA Isolation Kit (MoBio, USA) according to the manufacturer's instructions. DNA was quantified with an ND-2000 UV–Vis spectrophotometer (NanoDrop Technologies, USA).

Approximately 5 µg of DNA was added to Quick-Seal polypropylene tubes $(13 \times 51 \text{ mm}, 5.1 \text{ mL};$ Beckman Coulter, USA) and mixed with Tris-EDTA (TE; pH 8.0)/CsCl solution at a final buoyant density (BD) of ~ 1.77 g/mL. The BD was determined using a digital refractometer (model AR200; Leica Microsystems Inc., USA) and adjusted using CsCl solution or Tris-EDTA buffer. After balancing and sealing, the tubes were transferred to an ultracentrifuge (Optima L-100XP; Beckman Coulter) at 45,000 rpm (20 °C) for 48 h. After centrifugation, DNA was collected from each 400-µL fraction using a fraction recovery system (Beckman Coulter). The BD of each fraction was then measured, and the DNA fractions were purified following our previously published method (Song et al. 2015). The BD and DNA concentration of each fraction are listed in Figs. S1 and S2.

Quantitative polymerase chain reaction (qPCR)

The abundance of bacterial 16S rRNA gene in each fraction was determined by qPCR with bacterial universal primer pairs of Bac519f/Bac907r (Table 1). The PCR reactions were performed in a 20 µL mixture containing 10 µL of SYBR green PCR Premix Ex Taq II (TaKaRa, Japan), 0.2 μL of each primer (10 μm) and 1 µL of DNA template on ABI 7500 real-time PCR system (Applied Biosciences, USA). A 10-fold serial dilution of known copy numbers of the plasmid DNA extracted from E. coli were generated to produce the standard curve. The reactions were conducted following the process: an initial denaturation of 10 min at 94 °C, followed by 40 cycles of 30 s at 94 °C, 30 s at 55 °C, and 15 s at 72 °C. The SYBR green signal was collected after 20 s step at 72 °C in each cycle. The melt curve was obtained from 60 to 95 °C at a rate of 0.2 °C.

| Target | Primer | Sequence (5'-3') |
|----------------------|---------|------------------------------------|
| 16S rRNA | 515f | GTGCCAGCMGCCGCGGTAA |
| | 806r | AACGCACGCTAGCCGGACTACVSGGGTATCTAAT |
| | 27f | AGAGTTTGATCCTGGCTCAG |
| | 1492r | GGTTACCTTGTTACGACTT |
| | Bac519f | CA GCMGCCGCGGTAANWC |
| | Bac907r | CCGTCAATTCMTTTRAGTT |
| PAH-RHD _α | 610f | GAGATGCATACCACGTKGGTTGGA |
| | 911r | AGCTGTTGTTCGGGAAGAYWGTGCMGTT |
| | 641f | CGGCGCCGACAAYTTYGTNGG |
| | 933r | GGGGAACACGGTGCCRTGDATRAA |
| | 396f | ATTGCGCTTAYCAYGGBTGG |
| | 696r | ATAGGTGTCTCCAACRAARTT |

Table 1 Primers used for PCR amplification of 16S rRNA and PAH-RHD_{α} gene

High-throughput sequencing and computational analyses

PCR amplification of the hypervariable V4 region of the 16S rRNA gene was performed using the DNA fractions derived from ¹²C-PHE and ¹³C-PHE microcosms with the 515f/806r primer set (Table 1) (Bates et al. 2011). Each reaction (50 μ L) contained 25 μ L of rTaq premixed buffer (TaKaRa, Japan), 1 µL of each primer (100 nM), and 10-100 ng of template DNA. Unique 12-base nucleotide sequences were synthesised at the 5' end of each pair of primers as barcodes to assign sequences to the different fractions. The PCR program was 3 min at 95 °C; 35 cycles of 94 °C for 30 min, 55 °C for 1 min, and 72 °C for 1 min; and final extension at 72 °C for 10 min. Sequencing was conducted using the 2×250 bp PE mode on an Illumina MiSeq sequencer in a standard pipeline. Reads were filtered if they contained primer mismatches, uncorrectable barcodes or ambiguous bases, using the QIIME and a custom Perl script. The remaining sequences were analysed using the MOTHUR software package and assigned to operational taxonomic units (OTU) to generate microbiome profiles, according to the protocol described in our previous study (Li et al. 2017).

The relative abundance of each OTU was calculated as described previously (Luo et al. 2009). OTUs of the top 100 relative abundances were selected for analysis. PHE degraders were identified as the OTUs enriched in the heavy DNA fractions of ¹³C-PHE samples in comparison with ¹²C-PHE samples. In total, six OTUs (OTU_1, OTU_54, OTU_75, OTU_11, OTU_69 and OTU_108) were selected, which aligned to *Burkholderia* spp., *Paraburkholderia* spp., *Ralstonia* spp., *Sinobacteraceae* spp., *Kaistobacter* spp. and *Arthrobacter* spp. (accession numbers: KY319177-KY319182), respectively, using the Greengenes database. The phylogenetic information for these sequences was obtained using the Basic Local Alignment Search Tool (BLAST) algorithm (National Center for Biotechnology Information, USA) and Molecular Evolutionary Genetics Analysis (MEGA) software version 4.0.

Isolation of PHE degraders by enrichment and cultivation

PHE degraders were isolated from the same activated sludge as the SIP microcosms. Activated sludge samples (5 mL) were added to 50 mL of minimal medium (MM) (Table S2, pH = 7.0) with 1000 mg/L PHE (MM-P) as the carbon source. After incubation at 25 °C for 7 days, 5 mL of the cultural suspension was subcultured in 50 mL fresh MM-P and incubated under the same conditions for another 7 days. After three sequential rounds of enrichment, the enriched population was serially diluted and spread onto MM-P agar plates, which were incubated at 25 °C for 4 days. In total, 10 colonies were isolated, purified, and identified. Genomic DNA was extracted and the 16S rRNA gene sequence was PCR-amplified using the universal bacterial primers 27f and 1492r (Table 1). The 16S rRNA gene sequences obtained from isolated strains are available in GenBank under the following accession numbers: KY319174 for Microbacterium

sp. PHE-1, KY319175 for *Rhodanobacter* sp. PHE-2 and KY319176 for *Rhodococcus* sp. PHE-3. The PHE degradation capacities of the isolated strains were evaluated using our published method (Jiang et al. 2015) with incubation in MM supplemented with 100 mg/L PHE in the dark for 7 days on a 180-rpm shaking plate at 30 °C. All tests were carried out in triplicates with sterile controls, following the same incubation conditions for enrichment and isolation. PHE degradation efficiency was calculated from the change of PHE concentration, which was determined using the method described in the chemical analysis.

Detection of PAH-RHD_{α} genes

Three types of PAH-RHD $_{\alpha}$ gene (PAH-RHD $_{\alpha}$ L, PAH-RHD $_{\alpha}$ GP and PAH-RHD $_{\alpha}$ GN) were

investigated in the heavy DNA fraction using the primer sets 396f/696r, 641f/933r and 610f/911r (Table 1), respectively (Ding et al. 2010; Song et al. 2015). PAH-RHD_{α} L includes a wide range of PAH- RHD_{α} genes found in both Gram-positive (GP) and Gram-negative (GN) bacteria, while PAH-RHDa GP and PAH-RHDa GN genes are used to detect GP and GN bacterial populations that are capable of degrading PAHs, respectively. Gradient PCR reactions were performed at annealing temperatures of 52-62 °C (Cebron et al. 2008). However, only the PAH-RHD $_{\alpha}$ GN primer set produced a strong and specific amplicon, and it was selected for this study. In addition, the PAH-RHD_{α} gene in the DNA extracted from the isolated PHE degraders was also analysed. The amplification reactions were performed using previously described methods (Cebron et al. 2008; Ding



Fig. 1 The relative abundances and shift tendencies of operational taxonomic units (OTUs: OTU_1, OTU_54, OTU_75, OTU_11, OTU_69 and OTU_108) in the fractions



Buoyant Density (g ml-1)

with different buoyant densities (BDs) of DNA extracted from activated sludge supplemented with either ^{12}C - or ^{13}C -labelled PHE after 3 and 6 days of incubation

et al. 2010). The GenBank accession number for the partial PAH-RHD_{α} gene sequence obtained from heavy DNA fraction in the ¹³C-PHE microcosm is KY319173.

Chemical analysis

Triplicates from each treatment were used for PHE analysis on days 0, 3 and 6. The collected samples were spiked with 1000 ng of deuterated PAHs as a surrogate standard and were then thoroughly extracted twice with dichloromethane (DCM). The organic phase extracts were concentrated to about 0.5 mL after solvent exchange with hexane, then purified with a silica-gel/alumina column (8 mm i.d.) filled with neutral alumina (3 cm, 3% deactivated), neutral silica gel (3 cm, 3% deactivated) and anhydrous Na₂SO₄ (1 cm) from bottom to top, with 15 mL hexane/DCM (1:1, v/v) as eluent. After being concentrated to approximately 50 μ L using a gentle stream of N₂, 1,000 ng hexamethylbenzene was added to all samples as an internal standard prior to instrumental analysis. PHE was analysed using gas chromatography (model 7890; Agilent, Santa Clara, CA, USA) with a capillary column (DB-5MS, 30 m, 0.25 mm, 0.25 µm) and a mass spectrometric detector (MSD, model 5975; Agilent) according to previously reported methods (Jiang et al. 2015).

Results

PHE biodegradation in the activated sludge

PHE biodegradation in the ¹²C-PHE and ¹³C-PHE treatments is shown in Table S3. The PHE concentration in the sterile treatment decreased slowly from day 3 to 6. In contrast, significantly lower PHE residual concentrations were observed in the biotic treatments after 3 days of incubation, showing the important roles of indigenous microorganisms in PHE degradation. On day 6, residual PHE was only 10–13% and 12–15% in the ¹²C-PHE and ¹³C-PHE microcosms, respectively. Throughout the process of biodegradation, no significant difference (p > 0.05) was observed between the ¹²C-PHE and ¹³C-PHE treatments, consistent with our previous findings (Li et al. 2017).

Fig. 2 Phylogenetic tree of OTUs responsible for PHE degradation. Neighbour-joining tree based on 16S rRNA gene sequences showing the phylogenetic positions of the bacteria corresponding to OTU_1, OTU_11, OTU_54, OTU_69, OTU_75, OTU_108 and representatives of some related taxa. Bootstrap values (expressed as percentages of 1000 replications) > 50% are shown at the branch points. Bar represents 0.05 substitutions per nucleotide position

In situ PHE degraders as revealed by DNA-SIP

The relative abundance of total 16S rRNA defined at the family and genus levels indicated slight differences in the whole indigenous microbial communities between the ¹²C-PHE and ¹³C-PHE treatments (Fig. S3). Meanwhile, most of the abundant bacteria, such as members of unclassified phylotypes within the families *Xanthomonadaceae* and *Isosphaeraceae*, were enriched in both ¹²C-PHE and ¹³C-PHE microcosms.

The abundance of bacterial 16S rRNA gene was quantified using qPCR in DNA recovered from each fraction of all samples after ultracentrifugation. As shown in Fig. S4, the fractions with higher BDs (1.7317 or 1.7480 g/mL) for both activated sludge samples after 3 and 6 days of incubation contained the heavy DNA, in which the abundance of the bacterial 16S rRNA gene was significantly higher in ¹³C-PHE microcosms than those from the corresponding ¹²C-PHE treatments.

The indigenous microorganisms responsible for ¹³C assimilation were detected by comparing the relative abundances of specific OTUs between the ¹²C-PHE and ¹³C-PHE treatments from each fraction. As shown in Fig. 1, OTU_1, OTU_54, OTU_75, OTU_11, OTU_69 and OTU_108, found at higher BDs (1.7317 or 1.7480 g/mL, marked with a star), were enriched in the ¹³C-PHE microcosm on days 3 and 6. In contrast, no such enrichment or similar trends were detected in the ¹²C-PHE treatment. Additionally, there was a concomitant increase in the relative abundance of OTU_1 in the heavy fractions of ¹³C-PHE treatments from 0.22% on day 3 to 1.25% on day 6. Similarly, the relative abundances of OTU_69, OTU 75 and OTU 108 in the heavy DNA fractions of ¹³C-PHE treatments on day 6 (9.43, 0.25 and 0.85%, respectively) were significantly higher than those on day 3 (1.4, 0.13 and 0.18%, respectively). Although the relative abundances of OTU_11 and OTU_54 in the heavy DNA fractions of ¹³C-PHE treatments on



0.05

day 6 (0.21 and 0.15%, respectively) were lower than those on day 3 (1.85 and 2.97%, respectively), their relative abundances at higher BDs in the ¹³C-PHE treatments were significantly higher than those in the ¹²C-PHE microcosms (0.03 and 0.02% on day 6, respectively). Together, these results indicated that the organisms represented by OTU_1, OTU_54, OTU_75, OTU_11, OTU_69 and OTU_108 were incorporated in ¹³C-PHE assimilation and played central roles in PHE degradation.

Figure 2 shows phylogenetic information for the identified PHE degraders represented by the above OTUs. OTU 1 and OTU 54 belong to the genera Burkholderia and Paraburkholderia within the family Burkholderiaceae (phylum Proteobacteria, class Betaproteobacteria, order Burkholderiales). OTU_1 shares 100% similarity with the partial 16S rRNA gene sequences of strains Burkholderia calidae LMG 29321 (FCOX02000168), Burkholderia glebae LMG 29325 (FCOJ01000126) and Burkholderia turbans LMG 29316 (FCOD01000076), and these strains form a subclade with a high bootstrap value of 87. OTU_54 shares 100% similarity with strains Paraburkholderia heleia NBRC 101817 (BBJH0100082), Paraburkholderia mimosarum NBRC 106338 (BBJJ01000211) and Paraburkholderia silvatlantica SRMrh-20 (AY965240), and also forms a subclade with a bootstrap value of 87. OTU_75 is classified in the genus Ralstonia (phylum Proteobacteria, class Betaproteobacteria, order Burkholderiales, family Ralstonia) and shares 100% similarity with Ralstonia pickettii ATCC 27511 (JOVL0100020), forming a subclade with a high bootstrap value of 91. OTU 69 and OTU_11 are assigned to the genus Kaistobacter (phylum Proteobacteria, class Alphaproteobacteria, Sphingomonadales, family order Sphingomonadaceae) and family Sinobacteraceae (phylum Proteobacteria, class Gammaproteobacteria, order Nevskiales), respectively. OTU_108 is characterised as genus Arthrobacter (phylum Actinobacteria, class Actinobacteria, order Micrococcales, family Micrococcaceae) and shares 100% similarity with strains Arthrobacter niigatensis LC4 (AB248526), Arthrobacter NIO-1008 enclensis (JF421614), Arthrobacter scleromae YH-2001 (AF330692), Arthrobacter cryotolerans LI3 (GQ406812), Arthrobacter sulfonivorans ALL (AF235091) and Arthrobacter cryoconiti Cr6-08 (GU784867), and forms a subclade with a bootstrap value of 100.

Isolation and characterisation of PHE-degrading bacteria

To separate the strains classified in the six SIPidentified OTUs and explore their degradation mechanisms and enzymes, PHE-degrading bacteria were isolated from the activated sludge with PHE as the sole carbon source. In total, 10 colonies were isolated, purified and identified as members of the genera Microbacterium, Rhodanobacter and Rhodococcus. Of all PHE-degrading isolates, three strains (Microbacterium sp. PHE-1, Rhodanobacter sp. PHE-2 and Rhodococcus sp. PHE-3) were selected and their near-complete 16S rRNA gene sequences (> 1400 bp) were used to construct a phylogenetic tree with related taxa (Fig. 3). Based on the degradation performance of 100 mg/L PHE listed in Table S4, the most efficient strain was Microbacterium sp. PHE-1 (69.7% degradation within 7 days), followed by Rhodanobacter sp. PHE-2 and Rhodococcus sp. PHE-3, with 52.4 and 45.3% degradation efficiency over the same time period, respectively.

Occurrence of genes involved in PHE metabolism

The PAH-RHD $_{\alpha}$ genes from GN bacteria were successfully amplified and analysed from the heavy DNA fractions of the ¹³C-PHE treatment. In the present study, only one type of PAH-RHD_{α} gene (KY319173) was detected and sequenced, showing 98.4% similarity with the PAH-RHD gene of uncultured Pseudomonas sp. (AM743143.1), Delftia acidovorans Eh2-1 (AY367788.1) and Ralstonia sp. NI1 (AB066442.1) (Fig. 4). Though this PAH-RHD_{α} gene did not form a subclade with the above PAH-RHD genes, the phylogenetic analyses revealed its close affinities with them. Despite the considerable sequence homology with known PAH-RHD_{α} genes, multi-sequence alignment illustrated that our identified partial PAH-RHD_{α} gene has two hypervariable regions in its sequence, including bases 1-58 and 147-152 (Fig. 5A). The nucleotides from 1 to 58 are 100% identical to those from indigenous oil-degrading bacteria (KF155785.1) in the Yellow Sea (China), while those from 59 to 146 show 100% similarity to indigenous PHE-degrading bacteria (KX364042) in wastewater, Pseudomonas sp. (AM743143.1) and Shewanella sp. (KU372133.1). The final region (nucleotides 147-253) is 100% homologous to the nagAc gene encoding naphthalene



Fig. 3 Neighbour-joining tree based on 16S rRNA gene sequences showing the phylogenetic positions of the isolated PHE degraders and representatives of related taxa. Bootstrap

values > 50% are shown at the branch points. Bar represents 0.02 substitutions per nucleotide position

1,2-dioxygenase in *Comamonas* sp. (JN655512.1) and the *nahAc* gene encoding naphthalene dioxygenase (NDO) in *Burkholderia* sp. (AF448048.1). However, no PAH-RHD_{α} gene was successfully amplified from the three isolated PHE degraders using the same primer set.

Discussion

DNA-SIP has been successfully used to demonstrate that native microorganisms collected at field sites are

engaged in PHE biodegradation (Gutierrez et al. 2013; Jones et al. 2011). Our work applied ¹³C-PHE as substrate in DNA-SIP and identified six indigenous PHE-degrading microorganisms, namely phylotypes affiliated with *Burkholderia*, *Paraburkholderia*, *Ralstonia*, *Kaistobacter*, *Arthrobacter* and *Sinobacteraceae* (genus unclassified) from the activated sludge. These microorganisms are indicative of microbial populations directly responsible for PHE biodegradation. It should be noted that all OTUs identified as PHE degraders are rare species, and thus the abundance of



Fig. 5 A Multi-sequence alignment of PAH-RHD_{α} GN genes amplified from the heavy DNA fractions of the ¹³C-PHE treatment. The identified PAH-RHD_{α} gene (KY319173) shows a mosaic or hybridised pattern of alignment to other PAH-RHD genes in *Shewanella* sp. (KU372133.1), *Pseudomonas* sp. (AM743143.1) and two uncultured bacteria (KF155785.1 and KX364042.1), and with naphthalene dioxygenase (NDO) genes in *Comamonas* sp. (JN655512.1) and *Burkholderia* sp.

bacteria does not reflect their roles in pollutant assimilation owing to the occurrence of various carbon sources in their natural habitats. In the present study, the dominant bacteria, including members of unclassified phylotypes in the families *Xanthomonadaceae* and *Isosphaeraceae*, were not directly linked to PHE degradation. They might play roles in degrading other organic pollutants existing in the activated sludge and PHE addition can only promote the rare PHE-degrading species in this study.

The genera *Burkholderia* and *Paraburkholderia* belong to the family *Burkholderiaceae* within the

(AF448048.1). **B** Multi-sequence alignment of translated partial PAH-RHD from the amplified PAH-RHD gene. Yellow-boxed nucleotides and residues (square) represent contiguous consensus sequences between the PAH-RHD gene in this study and other PAH-RHD or NDO genes. Nucleotides and residues marked with an unfilled box (square) represent point mutations. This alignment was made using the CLUSTAL W-based optimal alignment tool. (Color figure online)

order *Burkholderiales* of the *Betaproteobacteria*. The genus *Burkholderia* was first described in 1992 (Yabuuchi et al. 2013). Members of this genus are characterised as GN, aerobic, non-spore-forming, straight or curved rod-shaped bacteria (Guentas et al. 2016). These bacteria are widespread in natural environments, including soils, plants, animals, and humans (Coenye and Vandamme 2003). *Burkholderia* are known to degrade various environmental contaminants, such as polychlorobiphenyls (Cámara et al. 2004) and PAHs (Kumar et al. 2008). Degradation of PHE by *Burkholderia* has been reported previously

(Kim et al. 2005). However, to our knowledge, in situ PHE degradation by indigenous Burkholderia has not been identified using DNA-SIP prior to this study. The genus Paraburkholderia has been proposed following the demarcation of the genus Burkholderia based on phylogenetic studies of 16S rRNA and several housekeeping genes (Sawana et al. 2014). According to the International Journal of Systematic and Evolutionary Microbiology (IJSEM) validation lists 164 and 165, the genus Paraburkholderia comprises at least 46 species (Gao et al. 2016). Some strains affiliated to Paraburkholderia possess the ability to metabolise caffeine, which is a key ingredient in many popular drinks, in particular tea and coffee (Gao et al. 2016). Nevertheless, Paraburkholderia has not been previously linked with PHE mineralization and thus their role in PAHs metabolism remains unclear. Our results provide unequivocal evidence that microorganisms in this taxon are among the primary indigenous organisms responsible for PHE degradation in the complex community of activated sludge.

The genus Ralstonia also belongs to the order Burkholderiales, but differs from Burkholderia spp. in its morphological/physiological characteristics, GC content and DNA-DNA hybridisation (Yabuuchi et al. 1995). This genus is highly unusual in that it contains strains that are opportunistic human pathogens able to survive in oligotrophic environments (Chen et al. 2001). Sequence analysis of the SIP-identified OTU_57 suggested its close relationship to Ralstonia pickettii ATCC 27511 (Fig. 2). Ralstonia pickettii is the typical strain of the genus Ralstonia, and is considered the only representative of clinical importance (Ryan et al. 2006). Although R. pickettii is not viewed as a major pathogen and its virulence is relatively low, it has been verified as a risk factor associated with infection and mortality. Microbes in this genus are also of considerable biotechnological interest due to their potential for biodegrading organophosphorus insecticides (Li et al. 2010) and aromatic compounds (Wongwongsee et al. 2013). Ralstonia strain BPH, which was isolated from mangrove sediments, can degrade 50-76% of 100 mg/L PHE within 2 weeks (Wongwongsee et al. 2013). Some DNA-SIP evidence from PAHs-contaminated soil revealed that Ralstonia is directly responsible for naphthalene biodegradation (Singleton et al. 2005). However, no studies have used SIP to demonstrate the PHE-degradation capacity of indigenous *Ralstonia*. Thus, our present results provide strong evidence that members of this genus are responsible for PHE degradation in activated sludge.

The family *Sinobacteraceae* is within the class *Gammaproteobacteria* and order *Nevskiales*. Members of the family *Sinobacteraceae* have been linked with PAHs degradation. Nogi reported that a cultivated bacterial strain, *Povalibacter uvarum*, possesses the ability to metabolise PAHs such as anthracene and PHE (Nogi et al. 2014). Strains in the genus *Polycyclovorans* exhibit a narrow spectrum of substrate metabolism, utilising various aromatic compounds including benzene, toluene, biphenyl, naphthalene, anthracene, and PHE as their sole or principal sources of carbon and energy (Gutierrez et al. 2012). To our knowledge, PHE degradation by indigenous *Sinobacteraceae* using DNA-SIP has not been documented previously.

Sequence analysis of the microorganism represented by OTU_69 suggested a close relationship to the genus Kaistobacter. Like Sphingobium, Kaistobacter belongs to the family Sphingomonadaceae within the class Alphaproteobacteria. It is usually detected at uranium mining and milling sites (Radeva et al. 2013), and in soils contaminated with heavy metals (Navarro-Noya et al. 2010). Kaistobacter has been reported to have the ability to biodegrade EPTC (S-ethyl dipropylthiocarbamate) and atrazine in soils (Liu et al. 2016). Moreover, Kaistobacter may supress the disease tobacco bacterial wilt (Liu et al. 2016). No information about the possible function of Kaistobacter in PAHs degradation is available, although Sphingobium is a well-known PAHs-degrading genus in the family Sphingomonadaceae. The taxon Kaistobacter has not been linked with PHE degradation previously, and thus their role at PAHs-contaminated sites remains unclear. The results from the present study provide strong evidence that microbes in this genus are among the primary indigenous organisms responsible for PHE degradation, which expands our knowledge of this genus.

The indigenous PHE-degrading bacteria in activated sludge were found to be diverse, with representatives affiliated with *Alphaproteobacteria*, *Betaproteobacteria* and *Gammaproteobacteria*, as well as *Actinobacteria* (Fig. 2). *Arthrobacter*, a genus of GP belonging to the *Micrococcaceae* family of *Actinobacteria*, is a catalase-positive, aerobic and asporogenous rod-shaped bacterium (Hu et al. 2016).

Arthrobacter species are known to have versatile metabolic capabilities, including degradation of organophosphorus pesticides (Singh and Walker 2006) and PAHs (Cebron et al. 2011). In addition, these bacteria are highly competitive in the presence of root exudates (Kozdrój and Elsas 2000). Some studies have reported that *Arthrobacter* species are the dominant PHE degraders in the presence of root exudates (Cebron et al. 2011; Kozdrój and Elsas 2000). Here, our results provide strong evidence that microbes in this genus are the dominant active PHE degraders in activated sludge.

Microbacterium and *Rhodococcus* have previously been confirmed as PHE degraders (Cebron et al. 2011; Liu et al. 2016). Unlike *Microbacterium* and Rhodococcus, no species in the genus Rhodanobacter has been directly linked to PHE degradation. Rhodanobacter is successfully used to build a consortium with Achromobacter sp. and Marinobacter sp. that are capable of efficiently degrading a wide range of PAHs (Arulazhagan et al. 2014). To our knowledge, this is the first example of Rhodanobacter exhibiting the ability to degrade PHE. However, results from the SIP experiment indicated that these strains did not contribute to in situ PHE degradation in the same activated sludge. The dramatic contradiction of cultivation-dependent and cultivation-independent approaches provide some insight into the reasons why constructed microconsortiums are often not as efficient as expected in the fields, that this inefficiency is caused by intensive competition of the inoculated strains face from a series of indigenous organisms (Jiang et al. 2015).

The presence of the distinctive PAH-RHD_{α} GN gene in the heavy DNA suggests it may be the functional gene employed by the PHE degraders identified by **DNA-SIP** in Burkholderia, Paraburkholderia, Ralstonia, Sinobacteraceae, Kaistobacter and Arthrobacter. It should be also noted that these PHE degraders might contain other functional genes that were not targeted by the primers used in this study. Additionally, the failure in amplifying PAH- RHD_{α} gene from the isolated PHE degraders might be attributed to incompatibility of the primers used in this study with some novel PAH-RHD genes or the presence of a different PHE degradation mechanism in these strains. Combined with the results that the isolated PHE degraders were not enriched in the heavy DNA fraction of ¹³C-PHE treatment, we provided indirect evidence for their non-participation in PHE degradation in activated sludge.

Notably, the PAH-RHD_{α} GN gene identified in the heavy DNA fractions exhibits a mosaic pattern, with alignment hybridised to different known genes encoding PAH-RHDs from Shewanella sp. (KU372133.1), Pseudomonas sp. (AM743143.1) and uncultured bacterium (KF155785.1 and KX364042.1) and NDOs from Comamonas sp. (JN655512.1) and Burkholderia sp. (AF448048.1) (Fig. 5A). The corresponding peptide residues (Fig. 5B) show that the first histidine (H) might be the Rieske-type [2Fe–2S] cluster binding site, which is the active site responsible for non-heme iron oxygenase targeting aromatic compounds (Ferraro et al. 2005). The region following this H has been identified as a conserved sequence in many studies, but a combination of several PAH-RHD and nagAc/nahAc genes are identified in the present work. Horizontal gene transfer (HGT) and hybridisation, which allow for creation of novel genes by homologous recombination of exogenous DNA, are two major mechanisms of reticulate evolution (Makarenkov et al. 2014). Bacteria acquire heterologous genes from foreign species by HGT, which help them adapt to changing environmental conditions (Zhaxybayeva et al. 2004). Hybridisation is a very common phenomenon in nature, especially among plants, amphibians and reptiles, but is rather rare among microorganisms (Makarenkov et al. 2014). Previous studies have shown that hybridisation plays an important role in generating adaptive variation and functional novelty (Zhang et al. 2017). Due to the high sequence similarity and homology in the function of oxygenating aromatic rings between the PAH-RHD and NDO genes, they may be shared and recombined extensively between genera via HGT or hybridisation. Our results suggest that the above evolutionary processes may have occurred in the present activated sludge, leading to the formation of the novel PAH-RHD $_{\alpha}$ gene.

Overall, DNA-SIP was first applied to identify the indigenous bacterial taxa responsible for PHE degradation in activated sludge from a municipal wastewater treatment plant. Besides the four well-known PHE degraders, *Paraburkholderia* and *Kaistobacter* were linked to PHE degradation for the first time. Analysis of one PAH-RHD_{α} gene detected in the heavy DNA fraction suggested that HGT or hybridisation may have occurred in the activated sludge and helped with the formation and spread of PAH-RHD genes within

the microbial community. Moreover, one isolated PHE degrader, *Rhodanobacter* PHE-2, was identified as the first example of PHE-degrading ability in the genus *Rhodanobacter*, although this strain did not participate in PHE degradation in situ. This work has added to our current understanding of indigenous microorganisms with the ability to degrade PHE during the wastewater treatment process.

Acknowledgements Financial support was provided by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (Nos. 41673111 & 41603072) and the Scientific and Technological Planning Project of Guangzhou, China (Nos. 201707020034 & 201510010038).

References

- Amann RI, Ludwig W, Schleifer KH (1995) Phylogenetic identification and in situ detection of individual microbial cells without cultivation. Microbiol Rev 59:143–169
- Arulazhagan P, Sivaraman C, Kumar SA, Aslam M, Banu JR (2014) Co-metabolic degradation of benzo(e)pyrene by halophilic bacterial consortium at different saline conditions. J Environ Biol 35:445–452
- Bahr A, Fischer A, Vogt C, Bombach P (2015) Evidence of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbon biodegradation in a contaminated aquifer by combined application of in situ and laboratory microcosms using (13)C-labelled target compounds. Water Res 69:100–109
- Bates ST, Berglyons D, Caporaso JG, Walters WA, Knight R, Fierer N (2011) Examining the global distribution of dominant archaeal populations in soil. ISME J 5:908
- Breznak JA (2002) A need to retrieve the not-yet-cultured majority. Environ Microbiol 4:4–5
- Cámara B, Herrera C, González M, Couve E, Hofer B, Seeger M (2004) From PCBs to highly toxic metabolites by the biphenyl pathway. Environ Microbiol 6:842–850
- Cebron A, Norini MP, Beguiristain T, Leyval C (2008) Realtime PCR quantification of PAH-ring hydroxylating dioxygenase (PAH-RHDalpha) genes from Gram positive and Gram negative bacteria in soil and sediment samples. J Microbiol Methods 73:148–159
- Cebron A, Louvel B, Faure P, France-Lanord C, Chen Y, Murrell JC, Leyval C (2011) Root exudates modify bacterial diversity of phenanthrene degraders in PAH-polluted soil but not phenanthrene degradation rates. Environ Microbiol 13:722–736
- Chen WM, Laevens S, Lee TM, Coenye T, De VP, Mergeay M, Vandamme P (2001) *Ralstonia taiwanensis* sp. nov., isolated from root nodules of Mimosa species and sputum of a cystic fibrosis patient. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 51:1729–1735
- Coenye T, Vandamme P (2003) Diversity and significance of Burkholderia species occupying diverse ecological niches. Environ Microbiol 5:719–729
- Ding GC, Heuer H, Zuhlke S, Spiteller M, Pronk GJ, Heister K, Kogel-Knabner I, Smalla K (2010) Soil type-dependent

responses to phenanthrene as revealed by determining the diversity and abundance of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbon ring-hydroxylating dioxygenase genes by using a novel PCR detection system. Appl Environ Microbiol 76:4765–4771

- Dumont MG, Murrell JC (2005) Stable isotope probing—linking microbial identity to function. Nat Rev Microbiol 3:499–504
- Ferraro DJ, Gakhar L, Ramaswamy S (2005) Rieske business: structure-function of Rieske non-heme oxygenases. Biochem Biophys Res Commun 338:175–190
- Gao Z, Yuan Y, Xu L, Liu R, Chen M, Zhang C (2016) Paraburkholderia caffeinilytica sp. nov., isolated from the soil of a tea plantation. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 66:4185–4190
- Guentas L, Gensous S, Cavaloc Y, Ducousso M, Amir H, Georges De, de Ledenon B, Moulin L, Jourand P (2016) *Burkholderia novacaledonica* sp. nov. and *B. ultramafica* sp. nov. isolated from roots of *Costularia* spp. pioneer plants of ultramafic soils in New Caledonia. Syst Appl Microbiol 39:151–159
- Gutierrez T (2011) Identifying polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbon-degrading bacteria in oil-contaminated surface waters at Deepwater Horizon by cultivation, stable isotope probing and pyrosequencing. Rev Environ Sci Bio 10:301–305
- Gutierrez T, Green DH, Nichols PD, Whitman WB, Semple KT, Aitken MD (2012) *Polycyclovorans algicola* gen. nov., sp. nov., an aromatic-hydrocarbon-degrading marine bacterium found associated with laboratory cultures of marine phytoplankton. Appl Environ Microbiol 79:205–214
- Gutierrez T, Singleton DR, Berry D, Yang T, Aitken MD, Teske A (2013) Hydrocarbon-degrading bacteria enriched by the Deepwater Horizon oil spill identified by cultivation and DNA-SIP. ISME J 7:2091–2104
- Hu QW, Chu X, Xiao M, Li CT, Yan ZF, Hozzein WN, Kim CJ, Zhi XY, Li WJ (2016) Arthrobacter deserti sp. nov., isolated from a desert soil sample. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 66:2035–2040
- Jameson E, Taubert M, Coyotzi S, Chen Y, Eyice Ö, Schäfer H, Murrell JC, Neufeld JD, Dumont MG (2017) DNA-, RNA-, and protein-based stable-isotope probing for highthroughput biomarker analysis of active microorganisms. Springer, New York
- Jiang L, Song M, Luo C, Zhang D, Zhang G (2015) Novel phenanthrene-degrading bacteria identified by DNAstable isotope probing. PLoS ONE 10:e0130846
- Zhang J-L, Ma Y-P, Wu Z-K, Dong K, Zheng S-L, Wang Y-Y (2017) Natural hybridization and introgression among sympatrically distributed Rhododendron species in Guizhou, China. Biochem Syst Ecol 70:268–273
- Jones MD, Crandell DW, Singleton DR, Aitken MD (2011) Stable-isotope probing of the polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbon-degrading bacterial guild in a contaminated soil. Environ Microbiol 13:2623–2632
- Keith LH, Telliard WA (1979) Priority Pollutants: I. A perspective view. Environ Sci Technol 13:416–423
- Kim J-D, Shim S-H, Lee C-G (2005) Degradation of phenanthrene by bacterial strains isolated from soil in oil refinery fields in Korea. J Microbiol Biotechnol 15:337–345
- Kozdrój J, Elsas JDV (2000) Response of the bacterial community to root exudates in soil polluted with heavy metals

assessed by molecular and cultural approaches. Soil Biol Biochem 32:1405–1417

- Kumar W, Lakshmi C, Khanna S (2008) Biodegradation and bioremediation of endosulfan contaminated soil. Bioresour Technol 99:3116–3122
- Lebaron P, Servais P, Agogue H, Courties C, Joux F (2001) Does the high nucleic acid content of individual bacterial cells allow us to discriminate between active cells and inactive cells in aquatic systems? Appl Environ Microbiol 67:1775–1782
- Ledin A, Patureau D (2010) Xenobiotics in the urban water cycle. Springer, Dordrecht
- Li J, Liu J, Shen W, Zhao X, Hou Y, Cao H, Cui Z (2010) Isolation and characterization of 3,5,6-trichloro-2-pyridinol-degrading Ralstonia sp. strain T6. Bioresour Technol 101:7479–7483
- Li J, Luo C, Song M, Dai Q, Jiang L, Zhang D, Zhang G (2017) Biodegradation of phenanthrene in polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbon-contaminated wastewater revealed by coupling cultivation-dependent and -independent approaches. Environ Sci Technol 51:3391–3401
- Liu X, Zhang S, Jiang Q, Bai Y, Shen G, Li S, Ding W (2016) Using community analysis to explore bacterial indicators for disease suppression of tobacco bacterial wilt. Sci Rep 6:36773
- Luo CL, Xie SG, Sun WM, Li XD, Cupples AM (2009) Identification of a novel toluene-degrading bacterium from the candidate phylum TM7, as determined by DNA stable isotope probing. Appl Environ Microbiol 75:4644–4647
- Makarenkov V, Boc A, Legendre P (2014) A new algorithm for inferring hybridization events based on the detection of horizontal gene transfers clusters, orders, and trees: methods and applications. Springer, New York, pp 273–293
- Minai-Tehrani D, Minoui S, Herfatmanesh A (2009) Effect of salinity on biodegradation of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) of heavy crude oil in soil. Bull Environ Contam Toxicol 82:179–184
- Navarro-Noya YE, Jan-Roblero J, del Carmen González-Chávez M, Hernández-Gama R, Hernández-Rodríguez C (2010) Bacterial communities associated with the rhizosphere of pioneer plants (*Bahia xylopoda* and *Viguiera linearis*) growing on heavy metals-contaminated soils. Anton Leeuw Int J G 97:335–349
- Nogi Y, Yoshizumi M, Hamana K, Miyazaki M, Horikoshi K (2014) Povalibacter uvarum gen. nov., sp. nov., a polyvinyl-alcohol-degrading bacterium isolated from grapes. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 64:2712–2717
- Oren A (2004) Prokaryote diversity and taxonomy: current status and future challenges. Philos Trans R Soc Lond B 359:623–638
- Radeva G, Kenarova A, Bachvarova V, Flemming K, Popov I, Vassilev D, Selenska-Pobell S (2013) Bacterial diversity at

abandoned uranium mining and milling sites in Bulgaria as revealed by 16S rRNA genetic diversity study. Water Air Soil Pollut 224:1748

- Ryan MP, Pembroke JT, Adley CC (2006) Ralstonia pickettii: a persistent gram-negative nosocomial infectious organism. J Hosp Infect 62:278–284
- Sawana A, Adeolu M, Gupta RS (2014) Molecular signatures and phylogenomic analysis of the genus Burkholderia: proposal for division of this genus into the emended genus Burkholderia containing pathogenic organisms and a new genus Paraburkholderia gen. nov. harboring environmental species. Front Genet 5:429
- Schwarzenbach RP, Escher BI, Fenner K, Hofstetter TB, Johnson CA, Gunten UV, Wehrli B (2006) The challenge of micropollutants in aquatic systems. Science 313:1072–1077
- Singh BK, Walker A (2006) Microbial degradation of organophosphorus compounds. FEMS Microbiol Rev 30:428–471
- Singleton DR, Powell SN, Sangaiah R, Gold A, Ball LM, Aitken MD (2005) Stable-isotope probing of bacteria capable of degrading salicylate, naphthalene, or phenanthrene in a bioreactor treating contaminated soil. Appl Environ Microbiol 71:1202–1209
- Song M, Luo C, Jiang L, Zhang D, Wang Y, Zhang G (2015) Identification of benzo[a]pyrene-metabolizing bacteria in forest soils by using DNA-based stable-isotope probing. Appl Environ Microbiol 81:7368–7376
- Wongwongsee W, Chareanpat P, Pinyakong O (2013) Abilities and genes for PAH biodegradation of bacteria isolated from mangrove sediments from the central of Thailand. Mar Pollut Bull 74:95–104
- Yabuuchi E, Kosako Y, Yano I, Hotta H, Nishiuchi Y (1995) Transfer of two Burkholderia and an Alcaligenes species to Ralstonia gen. Nov.: proposal of Ralstonia pickettii (Ralston, Palleroni and Doudoroff 1973) comb. Nov., Ralstonia solanacearum (Smith 1896) comb. Nov. and Ralstonia eutropha (Davis 1969) comb. Nov. Microbiol Immunol 39:897–904
- Yabuuchi E, Kosako Y, Oyaizu H, Yano I, Hotta H, Hashimoto Y, Ezaki T, Arakawa M (2013) Proposal of Burkholderia gen. nov. and transfer of seven species of the genus pseudomonas homology group II to the new genus, with the type species Burkholderia cepacia (Palleroni and Holmes 1981) comb. nov. Microbiol Immunol 36:1251–1275
- Zhang D, Berry JP, Zhu D, Wang Y, Chen Y, Jiang B, Huang S, Langford H, Li G, Davison PA, Xu J, Aries E, Huang WE (2015) Magnetic nanoparticle-mediated isolation of functional bacteria in a complex microbial community. ISME J 9:603–614
- Zhaxybayeva O, Lapierre P, Gogarten JP (2004) Genome mosaicism and organismal lineages. Trends Genet 20:254–260